

**Unapproved
PARKING ADVISORY BOARD
July 14, 2008**

Brenda Burkhartsmeier ✓	Randy Hafer✓
Steve Bruggeman ✓	Scott Wetzal (esc.)
Bruce Simon ✓	Gary Temple
Don Olsen	Nick Blake
Leticia Moore ✓	

NOTES:

The meeting was called to order at 4:29 p.m. Others present were: Bruce McCandless, Deloris Lix, Stacey Wagner, Chris Mallow and Kelly Cox.

MINUTES:

Steve motioned to approve the minutes from the June 16th meeting. Randy seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion carried.

OLD BUSINESS:

Bruce Simon asked again about what the city was paying in interest on the debt from the expansion in opposed to what was being made in interest on the reserve monies. He again stated that he believed it may be a good idea to take the reserve monies and pay off the debt earlier. The possibility of penalties for early pay-off of the debt was raised. Chris stated that he would look into this and see what he could find out.

MONTHLY REPORTS – June 2008:

There was very little change in garage rental spaces for June although there were a few people who left the Park 3 garage.

Cash sales for June were down by 0.9% from May.

Park & Shop was down by 11.5% from May. Part of this was the validations that were coming in from Park 4 garage due to tax season and the help that was needed for that in the surrounding businesses.

Crowne Plaza validations were down from May by 5.7%.

Adult Ed was down 64.7% from May. Chris attributes this to the lack of classes at the Lincoln center.

Token usage was up 4.0% from May.

10-hour permits were up 4 from May, a 113.46% increase from June of last year. Chris stated that at this time there are approximately 170 yellow headed 10-hour meters.

REQUEST AND RECOMMENDATIONS:

Park 1 & Park 4

Information:

The Parking Advisory Board asked Staff to gather information and report on whether or not we should make any changes to the hourly spaces in Parks 1 and 4. Staff has gathered the information by physical surveys of vacant hourly spaces and information provided monthly to the Parking Supervisor.

Hourly Garage Parking is designed to supply a parking space for those that need to park, temporarily, for a longer amount of time than on-street parking allows. Many short-term, 1 to 3 hour, customers will use the parking garage as a last resort.

Park 4 has 58 hourly spaces and physical surveys show that at any given time of the day there are about 31 spaces vacant or 54.7% that are not being utilized. Of those spaces that are being used: cash and Park and Shop customers are averaging over 4 hours per stay at the garage. The Lincoln Center customers are averaging between 2 to 4 hours per stay.

Park 1 has 27 hourly spaces and physical surveys show that at any given time of the day there are about 3 to 5 spaces vacant 15% that are not being utilized. Of those spaces that are being used: cash and Park and Shop customers are averaging over 4 hours per stay at this garage.

Staff Recommendation:

Staff recommends that a plan for the hourly spaces at each garage be formed. Staff will identify some points to consider:

- How do we deal with monthly customers who forget or misplace their card?
- Does the Parking Division need to have a Staff member working in the garage booth? What would be entailed in retrofitting an automated system into that garage?
- The roof has historically been considered overflow for hourly customers; without the hourly spaces should the roof be over rented as the normal monthly spaces currently are?

- Is there sufficient on-street parking for the hourly customers to use if they do not rent a space in the garage?
- Is there sufficient demand for converted hourly spaces?
 - As of 6/16: Park 1 – Yes
 - Park 4 – Yes

After discussion in regards to the benefits of keeping a staff member available, Chris stated that it is Staff’s recommendation, for Park 1 garage, to leave the current hourly spaces as is and over-rent the roof at 120%, thus adding 20-22. Chris stated that currently there are 27 people on the waiting list for covered spaces and 45 for the roof. He also recommended changing all but 15 hourly spaces, in Park 4, to monthly covered spaces and see how that would effect the hourly business in this garage. Bruce Simon motioned to convert 100% of the hourly spaces to monthly covered spaces. There was no second to the motion and the motion failed. Randy moved to accept Staff’s recommendation. Steve seconded the motion. Motion passed.

Ten-minute zone policy direction:

Information:

Staff was asked during the April Parking Advisory Board meeting to do some research and come back with criterion for creating a 10-minute zone policy. Staff spoke to parking professionals from Boise, ID, Eugene, OR, Boulder, CO, and Fort Collins, CO. Here is a list of points and principals they use when managing their 10-minute zones.

- While technically these zones do not produce meter revenue, they are an important element in developing a diverse Downtown area. They help support a wide variety of businesses but should be closely managed.
- Limited number per block-face.
- Of those interviewed, “grandfathering” existing spaces with no changes is the best course of action for the zones that already exist.
- Of those interviewed, all stated that charging a fee for 10-minute spaces would be detrimental to our downtown area and problematic to administer.
- All of the cities interviewed use signs instead of meters; due to the confusion and frustration that very short-term meters create.

Staff also recommends using a business classification system for approving new 10-minute zones; such as Standard Industrial Classification (SIC) system. Request businesses would have to fall into the appropriate business classification per the SIC. Staff and the PAB will have to designate the groups with the SIC that can request and be allowed to have 10-minute zones.

Staff Recommendation:

Staff recommends discussion with the Parking Advisory Board and a draft policy should be created.

Chris also spoke with Carl Walker and Walker Parking Consultants. He stated that these people as part of the services offer the knowledge and expertise in helping Boards and communities in making these types of policies.

This item was closed with the understanding that the information that Chris provided was informational and that more discussion was needed.

Minnesota Avenue streetscape and angled parking plan action item:

Information:

At the June, 2008, Parking Advisory Board meeting, Randy Hafer, of High Plains Architects, brought forth design drawings for a streetscape and angled parking plan for Minnesota Ave. There was discussion among PAB members about the details of the plan. Staff was directed to find out how the Parking Division could fund the parking element of the Minnesota Ave plan. The plan was brought forth so the Parking Advisory Board could see the plan and decide if they want to endorse it or not. At the June meeting, this item was not on the agenda as an action item so Staff was directed to place this issue on the July, 2008, agenda so the Parking Advisory Board could vote for support or non-support of this issue.

Staff Recommendation:

Vote of Support or Non-support is recommended.

There was a lengthy discussion on what exactly Randy, Stacey Wagner and the Old Town Neighbors were looking for from the Board. During this discussion Randy asked Bruce McCandless for his advice on how to proceed with this project. Bruce stated that he believed that the Old Town Neighbors needed to bring the project to a City Council work session and present the idea there. Bruce advised Randy that they should be prepared with all the information they had for this project. Bruce also stated that the business owners should anticipate S.I.D.'s for this project.

Chris advised Randy that there are possible CTEP grant monies that may be available for this project and that it may be possible that some Parking Division monies could be used. Chris also stated that while researching the last diagonal parking project, he found that a traffic engineering firm had been hired to draw the plans and what the exact scope of the project would be. A bid packet was sent out for the physical work involved and a competitive bid was taken. There were also S.I.D.'s that were assessed to business owners on Broadway to help pay for this project. The total cost of that project in 2001 totaled \$184,000.

Randy stated that the Old Town Neighbors were looking for creative low cost options, one of which would be painting of the crosswalk areas with large pots that would be used for crosswalk indicators. He stated that they were hoping that changing the parking design would spur the momentum for additional improvements in this area. He also stated that this area is on the 2009 fiscal year schedule with the streets department to do away with unused curb cuts.

Additionally, he has sent updated drawings to Debbie in the City Engineering Office and is waiting to hear back from them. Randy believes that by angling the parking in this area it will bring an aesthetically pleasing atmosphere to the area and create a more traffic calming environment. Overall Randy stated he is looking for the Parking Advisory Board's support for the "concept" that the Old Town Neighbors has brought forth.

Bruce Simon motioned that the P.A.B. support the concept of diagonal parking on Minnesota Ave. Steve seconded the motion. After some discussion, Bruce amended his motion to state throughout all of the area portrayed in gray as designated on the map that Randy supplied to the Board, now known as the Old Town Neighborhood. Steve 2nd the amended motion. With more discussion, Bruce withdrew his motion and his amended motion. Steve motioned that the Board should endorse the parking concepts listed as the "grey area" on the map that Randy provided on the map. Bruce seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion passed. Chris stated that he would write a letter in support of the Old Town Neighborhood for them to take to the Council work session.

PARKING MANAGEMENT POLICIES:

The question was posed, "Where is the board at in regards to writing policies?" Chris stated that 10-minute zones were his first step at addressing policies but that the Board had shown interest in policies for advertising, such as marquee on or in the parking garages, on-street parking such as loading zones, handicap spaces, 10-minute zones, ect. It was suggested that a list be drafted of the policies that should be looked at. Randy suggested a three step plan. His idea;

- 1) Mission statement- start & finalize (Chris needs to bring back the 2 existing drafts).
- 2) Detailed map of downtown with all types of parking notated on the map.
- 3) Policies discussion
 - a) definitive list
 - b) what policies should exist?

It was suggested that the Parking Board minutes be gone through to see what historically the Board had done. It was also suggested that there wasn't a need to look to the past that the Board could start from now.

Bruce Simon stated that he believed that the Board could be using their time more effectively such as not having Chris read the monthly reports but just to take questions in regards to the reports.

Bruce McCandless suggested that Chris, Brenda and himself get together to set up an agenda to help the discussion about policies be more fruitful.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS:

Strategy 5 will be sending Chris the valuation report for Park 4 garage sometime this week. Chris said that he would e-mail or mail the results to the Board members. He states that at this time he understands that it should price out somewhere in the area of 4-5 million dollars.

Cop Shop volunteers will begin issuing citations for violators of handicap spaces around the Billings area. They hope to be ready to start as of August 1. Kelly and Chris will be attending a training class for the volunteers on July 31 at 1:00 p.m. Penni Reed is the supervisor in this area and is quite excited about starting this new venture.

NEW BUSINESS:

None to report.

DBP REPORT:

DBP still continues to work on the quiet zone for the downtown area, the Babcock Theatre, Northern Hotel and garage, the new Federal Courthouse and Art space.

DBA REPORT:

None to report.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Deloris Lix addressed the Board before the Board officially was called to order as they were waiting for a quorum. She was asked if she would like to wait until there was a quorum but she stated that she was o.k. with proceeding before then. Deloris wanted the Board to know her concerns about selling or privatizing the parking garages. She states that her concerns are that the City is selling off the sources of their income and that this just does not make sense. She was also concerned about the DBA getting a portion of the monies collected by meter revenue, once again giving away part of the revenue collected. Brenda explained that the P.A.B. and the City looked at the possibility of selling Park 4 garage before the garage was full and that both the City and the P.A.B. were looking at selling Park 4 to create options to expand parking in the downtown area.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 6:04 p.m.