

Approved
PARKING ADVISORY BOARD
January 11, 2010

Randy Hafer√
Bruce Simon√
Nick Blake √
Mitch Goplen √

Steve Bruggeman (esc.)
Don Olsen √
Leticia Moore √
Scott Godfrey (esc.)

NOTES:

The meeting was called to order by Chris at 4:05 p.m. and started with elections. Randy joined the meeting at 4:07 and took over from Chris. Others present were: Chris Mallow and Kelly Cox.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:

DEPUTY CHIEF O'CONNELL:

Chief O'Connell was unable to attend the meeting.

REPORTS AND ACTION ITEMS:

Elections:

Randy volunteered to be Chairman. There were no other nominees or volunteers for this position. Don asked that Randy refrain from pushing his own agenda and focus on running the meeting. Bruce S. asked that Randy try harder to be on time. Randy stated that he understood both concerns and would try and accommodate the requests. All members were in favor of Randy continuing to be the Chairman for the Board.

Nick nominated Bruce S. as Vice-Chairman. Bruce S. declined stating he may be gone for an extended amount of time in the near future due to health reasons. Bruce S. nominated Leticia for the Vice Chairman position. All members were in favor and Leticia accepted the Vice Chairman position.

Request Meeting Date Change:

Chris asked Randy to amend the agenda so Staff and the Board could discuss the possibility of changing the scheduled meeting date of the Parking Advisory Board from the second Monday of the month to the second Tuesday of the month. Chris explained that Scott Godfrey was led to believe that the P.A.B.

meetings were regularly scheduled for the second Tuesday of the month and he has a scheduling conflict that he cannot get out of on the second Monday of every month at his job. Chris explained that Scott would have to resign from the Board if the meeting could not be changed to a different day. Mitch stated that on occasion he attends other hospital Board meetings on Tuesday but it should not be a regular issue for him. Bruce S. stated that the meeting could not be on Wednesday due to the Downtown Property Owners meeting and Leticia stated that Fridays would not work for her. Bruce S. moved that the meeting be moved to the second Tuesday of each month at 4:00 p.m. Don seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion passed.

Approve minutes from December meeting:

Don motioned to approve minutes as written from December. Bruce S. seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion passed.

Financial Statement Handouts:

Chris had quarterly Income Statement and Balance Sheet hand outs for the Board to review. Chris explained that the \$319,125 and the \$77,683 under Downtown Future Capital expense was the Park 1 elevator. He stated that there were run over expenses for the completion of the painting project under Garage Expenses and that the debt service payment was lumped in with Parking Administration costs.

Bruce S. stated that he noticed that revenue was down and expenses were up as a whole. Chris explained that the loss of revenue came from the loss of customers in Park 1 and Park 4. He stated that he believed the Park 1 drop was due to the move of the 1st Interstate Bank relocation and that Park 4 has lost 29 spaces from Billings Clinic. Don suggested that he felt that society as a whole is in a slump. Bruce S. suggested that changing Park 1 and Park 4 to all monthly may help to reduce expenses. Chris stated that it was the belief of himself and Bruce M. that it doesn't seem necessary to go thru the work to convert Park 4 since it is up for sale. Chris stated that he is in the process of moving the server from Park 4 to the City's I.T. Department. Bruce S. stated he felt it was important to address the financial health of the Parking Division now rather than wait until there was a problem.

The Board asked if Chris could have the debt service payment set as a sub-category of the Administration expense instead of lumped in as a whole. Chris stated he would speak with Finance and see if they would do that.

The sale of Park 4 came up as part of the financial discussion when Randy asked how things were going with the sale. Chris explained that Staff was working with Strategy 5 to get all their insurance information. He stated that there were new forms and new templates that were put in to effect which require

more information in regards to professional liability insurance and even vehicle liability coverage. Additionally, there were concerns in regards to possible problems with the State Board of Realtors complaining about Strategy 5 helping with the sale of Park 4. As a past member of the Board of Realtors, Mayor Hanel stated that there should be no problem since Strategy 5 is not acting as a realtor and is not receiving any type of commission on the sale. Ernie from Strategy 5 is already beginning work as he anticipates there will be no issues. Chris stated that there were still interested parties in buying the garage even with the delay of the marketing.

Chris was also asked to see if Finance could get a projected midyear budget report to see where the Parking Division was going to stand for this budget year.

Bruce S. questioned the projected 5% increase in wages. He stated that this was not reasonable or sustainable. Chris stated that this was part of the Union contract and that he did not expect the Union to give this up. The Union contract will need to be renegotiated this year as the contract ends on June 30, 2010. Chris stated that the COLA (Cost of Living Adjustment) will more than likely be addressed during the negotiations.

As part of Chris' business plan Bruce McCandless suggested a few ways to reduce expenses. He suggested getting rid of the transfer to the general fund as suggested by the Parking Board, changing Park 1 to monthly only and a rate increase for street parking.

It was suggested that Chris look into the possibility of getting the scanning programming for enforcement, the possibility of removing all meters in downtown and the suggestion from Rich and Associates of raising the 10-hour meter permits as they are now competing with the garage roof spaces.

Bruce S. suggested having another retreat to discuss where the Parking Division/Parking Board is going and to have a general discussion on what needs to be done and issues that need to be addressed. Randy stated that he felt this would be a good time to do that and to get everyone up to speed on what was going on since there were two new Board members with a possible one more joining soon. Bruce S. suggested talking with Chris Johnson from the Crowne Plaza again and Randy also had someone in mind.

Monthly Report – December 2009:

Chris explained the monthly report for Mitch's benefit. There were no questions in regards to the report except that Chris had not received the counts for the 10-hour meter permits from the DBA as of yet.

Park 1 Conversion to Monthly Only:

Information:

At the October Parking Advisory Board meeting Bruce Simon asked Staff to prepare a cost/benefit report for taking the Park 1 Parking garage to completely monthly thereby reducing one staff member and eliminating all transient parking. Currently Park 1 has 27 stalls signed as Hourly Only for customers needing to park downtown for longer than the two hour on-street meters allow but not frequently enough to justify paying a rental space in the garage for an entire month.

Currently:

Total hourly revenue in October 2009 for Park 1:	\$ 1,382.33
Total hourly revenue budgeted for Park 1:	\$14,500.00
Total number of people on waiting list for a covered space:	0

Direct Savings/(Costs) if converted to Park 1:

Personal costs:	\$49,700.00
Additional Revenue:	\$19,200.00
▪ Assuming all spaces are rented at \$50/each	
▪ Assuming renting 27 @ 120% = 32 spaces	
Net gain/(loss) to Park 1 budget	\$54,400.00

Service Impacts/Enhancements to Park 1:

- Lower ability to respond to customer's concerns such as security, cleanliness, and equipment failure without a garage attendant present at the garage.
- Unemployment costs would also be a factor and not included.
- Parking Enforcement would not have to cover garage shifts which would result in more days of enforcement.
- Higher amount of on-street abuse due to those former hourly customers now having to park on-street; leading to negative public impact.
- Maintenance of Monthly Customer Lists and Billing duties will need to be reassigned to Parking Division Staff resulting in larger workloads for existing Parking Staff.
- Ability to respond to updates for parking groups and changes to billing.
- Staff time will be needed to check operability of garage systems on a more frequent basis.
- Garage will be closed to public during downtown events that draw large amounts of people.

Staff Recommendation:

Staff advises the PAB that there is currently nobody waiting for spaces in the Park 1 garage. In October 2009 the occupancy for covered spaces was at 108% or about 32 spaces vacant.

Staff recommends that this action be tabled until the demand is present before any changes are made to the supply.

AMENDED STAFF RECOMMEDATION: After discussion on this issue Staff decided to change his recommendation to changing the garage to monthly only.

Don suggested that there could be some kind of compromise such as moving the card reader location up to the monthly only level and installing four hour meters in the hourly section. Chris stated he would look to see the feasibility of doing this and get back to the Board with his findings. It was suggested that maybe Staff could work out some sort of program for MSUB. It was also suggested that lowering the monthly rates for Park 1 could increase the patronage for this garage.

Don motioned to table this item until Chris can check out the feasibility of putting in meters. Leticia seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion passed.

OLD BUSINESS:

Map of Medical Corridor Diagonal Parking (handouts):

Chris received a copy of a map of the medical corridor from Terry Smith. The map was from 2003 and did not show the new construction at Billings Clinic or the new parking garage at St. Vincent's. Mitch stated that they had a more current map. The yellow zone on the north side of 11th Ave. N. was again brought up. Chris stated he would find out why this whole area is a yellow zone and get back to the Board. Bruce suggested that a meeting with a representative from both the Billings Clinic and St. Vincent's be held to get their input on diagonal parking in the medical corridor. Bruce suggested that it may be possible to have the hospitals pay for the restriping and possibly a fee for the City's Enforcement. Don suggested a sort of maintenance district type program.

Mitch Goplen, the newest member of the Parking Advisory Board, is the Executive Director of Facility Services for Billings Clinic. He has worked for Billings Clinic for 24 years and is the contact person for Billings Clinic for parking issues. Mitch stated that he believes Billings Clinic would be willing to pay for the restriping and signage in the Billings Clinic area which extends from N. 27 to N. 30th and 7th Ave. N to 11 Ave. N. He stated that the Clinic applied for diagonal parking in the past and their application was denied by the City and was led to believe that the City Council was against the idea. He stated that it is the Clinic's desire to see the 2-hour signed parking stay in effect. He also stated that it is their wish to be able to keep the parking as close as possible to the doors for their patients and their possible medical needs. The Clinic has found that the temporary diagonal parking that is in effect now is a tremendous success and would like to see more. From the studies the Clinic has done they found that they could add 235 spaces if the diagonal parking was approved. Mitch also stated that the Clinic has appropriations for a parking structure and are looking at where to put it. Mitch stated that the Clinic owns property all the way to 6th Ave. N. and the Board may want to consider going with diagonal parking all the way to 6th Ave. N.

Randy stated that a meeting should be held with Parking Advisory Board members, Mitch, from Billings Clinic, his counterpart from St. Vincent's, along with contacting Gary Roller General Manager of the Mustang's from Dehler Park and work on a complete package to send to City Council.

NEW BUSINESS:

DBA Report:

Project homeless connect will take place on January 29th at the Library. The meters on N. 30th St. between 4th & 6th Avenues N. will be signed as parking for Service Providers only during this time. City Enforcement will not be enforcing in this area during this time.

DBP Report:

Don stated that the D.B.P. has reactivated their program to help with façade and signage repairs for downtown Billings businesses.

Informational Items:

The replacement of the Park 1 elevator has been delayed. The elevator was due to go out of commission on January 4 but the City is still waiting on delivery of the elevator. Staff expects this to happen at the end of January or the beginning of February.

There is a possible S.I.D. tax that will be assessed to the downtown businesses to help pay for the chip seal, conversion of one way streets to two way streets and the new street light projects.

Chris just received the Capital Improvement workbook for fiscal year 2011. He will be adding a condition audit of the garages which needs to be done every 4 to 5 years. The last audit was done in 2005/2006. Additionally he will add the repair of the N. 29th St. sky bridge. Depending on what City Council decides to do in regards to the amount of renovation the project could come in between \$170,000 and \$300,000. It was suggested by Bruce S. that the City restrict access to the bridge to alleviate any issues with vandalism. Chris stated he would look into the A.D.A. compliance in regards to this bridge and let the Board know if this is feasible.

Rich and Associates will have the revisions to the Parking Study by the end of the week. Bruce M. asked that the possibility of a convention center on Montana be added in with the information in regards to whose idea this is. This information was forwarded via Greg Kruger.

Adjourn:

The meeting was adjourned at 5:55 p.m.