

**Approved**  
**PARKING ADVISORY BOARD**  
**October 12, 2010**

Randy Hafer√  
Bruce Simon √  
Nick Blake (Esc.)  
Mitch Goplen √  
Drew Smith √

Steve Bruggeman√  
Don Olsen √  
Leticia Moore √  
Scott Godfrey √

**NOTES:**

The meeting was called to order by Randy at 4:03 p.m, Others present were: Greg Krueger, Tina Volek, Chris Mallow and Kelly Cox.

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:**

None to report.

**REPORTS AND ACTION ITEMS:**

Approve minutes from September:

Randy pointed out that there was an error and that C.T.A. needed to be changed to C.D.A. Scott motioned that the minutes from the September meeting be accepted with the changes. Don seconded the motion. All members were in favor and the motion passed.

Monthly Report- September 2010:

Chris reported that there was a large jump in validations due to a voluntary jury orientation that was sent out from Municipal Court where 500 letters were sent out. Potential Jurors thought it was a mandatory orientation when in fact it was voluntary.

Chris explained that the reporting of the 10-hour meter permits will be changed to have information broken down into the different monthly permits sold within a month instead of just the total number of permits sold each month. Bruce S. suggested that this start at the beginning of the calendar year so that the numbers do not get skewed.

Urban Outdoor Gallery discussion with Tina Volek:



1878\_001.pdf

Tina joined the meeting at 4:40 p.m. to discuss the handout about the possibility of having banners displaying Montana/Billings art hanging from Park 1 garage. She stated that she was not an advocate of this program but would like the Parking Advisory Board to give her their recommendation on this project. Tina fielded some questions from the Board in regards to the specifics of the project. Tina stated that it was her understanding that this would not be a cost to the City however if the Parking Board was looking at donating to the project that could be looked at. Tina told the board that the project was looking for sponsors at this time. Greg stated that the D.B.A. had not yet been approached in regards to this project however; Greg stated that most new garages are built with meshing on them for purposes such as this. Randy stated that he would like to see a presentation to get all the details. There were some concerns in regards to liability issues if the banner was to fall. Tina stated that these were valid concerns and that they were issues that would need to be worked out. Other Board members agreed that they would like to see a presentation. Tina stated that she would contact Solo Graphics and invite them to come to the November 9<sup>th</sup> meeting.

Staff Report on Garage rates:

DATE:           SEPTEMBER 1<sup>ST</sup>, 2010  
TO:             PARKING ADVISORY BOARD  
FROM:          CHRIS MALLOW, PARKING SUPERVISOR  
SUBJECT:      PARKING GARAGE RATE CHANGES

Information:

During the July, 2010, Parking Advisory Board meeting the Board discussed possibly raising the rates in the Park 3 garage based on the demand for monthly spaces. Staff has prepared a new rate structure for monthly parking in the Park 3 garage.

Park 3 Garage	Total Spaces	Current Rate	Total Current Revenue	New Rate	Total Proposed Revenue	Difference
ROOF	75	\$22.50	\$20,250	\$31.50	\$28,350	\$8,100
Covered	119	\$45.00	\$64,260	\$58.50	\$83,538	\$19,278
Assigned	4	\$90.00	\$4,320	\$90.00	\$4,320	\$0
<b>Total</b>	<b>198</b>		<b>\$88,830</b>		<b>\$116,208</b>	<b>\$27,378</b>
Roof increases from \$25 to \$35/month						
Covered increases from \$50 to \$65/month						
Figured with a 10% average discount						

Staff has also noticed the utilization of the Assigned spaces has declined in accordance with the tiered rate structure passed in 2006. The rate was initially increased from \$50/month to \$65/month and increased every year until the rate reached \$100/month, effective September 1, 2010. Current utilization for assigned spaces is:

- Park 1: 23/33 spaces rented or 69.7%
- Park 2: 58/68 spaces rented or 85.3% (down from 82 spaces in June 2009)
- Park 3: 4/4 spaces rented or 100%
- Park 4: 88/151 spaces rented or 58.3%

Staff received many complaints stating that the price is the main reason patrons are giving these spaces up. Another reason is the availability of lower cost spaces in the garage they are parking in. Staff requests the Parking Advisory Board consider lowering the Assigned rates as a method to increase utilization of these spaces.

ASSIGNED SPACES				
Current				
	Spaces Rented	Space Cost	Monthly Total	Annual Total
Park 1	23	\$100	\$2,300	\$27,600
Park 2	58	100	\$5,800	\$69,600
Park 3	4	100	\$400	\$4,800
Park 4	88	100	\$8,800	\$105,600
Proposed				
Park 1	23	\$80	\$1,840	\$22,080
Park 2	58	80	\$4,640	\$55,680
Park 3	4	100	\$400	\$4,800
Park 4	88	75	\$6,600	\$79,200

The above table shows impacts on revenue given rates are adjusted as shown. The proposed rates were selected based upon customer comments and observed reductions in utilization of assigned spaces.

Difference		
Park 1	-\$460	6.133
Park 2	-\$1,160	15.47
Park 3	\$0	0
Park 4	-\$2,200	29.33

The difference section shows reduction of revenue and how many more spaces would need to be rented to break-even with current revenue. Staff believes that utilization would increase to above the break-even point.

**Staff Recommendation:**

Staff recommends proceeding with the rate changes listed above. This would include preparing a rate resolution for City Council for their approval.

It was noted by Bruce S. that he believed that we wouldn't necessarily get new renters but that covered renters would just take the reserved spaces thus leaving covered spaces available instead of reserved spaces. Bruce stated that he thought it was important to change the resolution to state that changes could be made "up to a certain amount" giving the Parking Board some flexibility so that the Board wouldn't have to go back to the City Council for minimal changes. Leticia stated that unless the spaces were very convenient to exits there wouldn't really be a reason to pay more. Additionally she was concerned that changing rates now would look bad as the rate increase just went into effect.

Randy asked Chris at what point the reserved spaces started dropping off. Chris stated he believed it was after the rate increased past the \$75/mo. price. Drew asked if Chris felt that there were just too many reserved spaces. Chris stated he didn't believe so, hoping that there would be increased development which would then increase demand for the spaces.

Bruce motioned that the Board endorse the increase at P3 garage but hold off on the other garages until information was obtained from the consultants. Drew seconded the motion. Both Mitch and Don were opposed to the raise at Park 3. Don and Mitch were concerned that there was not enough information in regards to the possible fall out of doing this. Steve was concerned that it may push people out into the street. Scott stated he'd like to wait until more information was obtained from the consultants. Bruce S. then withdrew his motion with Drew agreeing to withdraw.

### **OLD BUSINESS:**

#### **Updates to Strategic Planning List of Projects:**

a. Sub-committee report:

In August the Sub-committee that included Drew Smith, Bruce Simon, Randy Hafer, Chris Mallow, Deb Meling, Chris Hertz & Wyeth Friday convened to discuss the changes that the Board spoke about in the July meeting. The Planning & Engineering Department was not opposed to any of the ideas the P.A.B. suggested but needed to do some research. The Planning & Engineering Department took the information and stated that they would get back to the Parking Board. Chris will invite the Planning & Engineering Department to join the November 9<sup>th</sup> meeting with the updates they have.

#### ***PARKING ADVISORY BOARD – Planning Decisions (3/16/10)***

1. *Support/encourage diagonal parking in hospital corridor and Dehler Park (underway at Clinic); City to do Dehler Park; Chris to contact SVHC*

The Diagonal Parking project around Dehler Park is still on hold at the Engineering Department waiting on the handicap spaces that were requested. It was suggested that Sanderson/Stuart, Mike Whitaker, Terry Smith & Mitch Gopen get together and work out this project to get at least the east and north sides done.

2. *Support EBURD parking overlay zoning (underway – final council approval 3/22/10)*
3. *Recommend changes to CBD parking Option 1*
  - *Adopt anti-shuffling ordinance (Chris to research; 6 month phase in)*

- 3 “zones”:
  - 2 hr. metered in highest use/turnover areas
  - 10 hr. metered in desirable long stay locations
  - Remove meters at fringe areas with low utilization

*Option 2*

- *Adopt anti-shuffling ordinance*
- 3 “zones”:
  - 2 hr. signed (no meters) in highest use/turnover areas
  - 10 hr. metered in desirable long stay locations + pass
  - Remove meters/time limits in fringe areas
- *Chris to get consultant opinion, then conference call*

*Either option must support & encourage continued use of garages*

- *Adjust 10 hr. rates to support garages*
- *With Option 2, increase fines for shuffling or overstaying limit*
- *With Option 2, update technology to enforce*
- *Retain courtesy tickets for 1<sup>st</sup> offences*
- *Retain monthly 10 hr. passes*

4. *Work on Parking Division Finances*

- *Letter to Council strongly recommending phasing out Parking Division transfer to General Fund (233k/yr.)*
- *RH/GK to draft letter; signed by all; bond new garage, etc.; present at Work Session with several members, letters of support*

5. *Recommend changes to parking for rest of city (per list)*

- Provide diagonal parking for on-street parking whenever possible (or perpendicular in street centers where available)*
- Encourage an interconnected grid of streets in new developments*
- Require all new streets in commercial areas to be designed to accommodate on-street parking*
- Allow on-street parking to count as part of total parking requirement or make on-street parking a mandatory offset of on-street parking*
- Allow an offset for bicycles/scooters/motorcycles (biking racks downtown)*
- Allow compact/energy efficient car spaces as part of the total requirement (smaller)*
- Create a standard for the maximum number of parking spaces provided depending on project type; change current into maximum; set new floor*
- Allow/encourage parking sharing between parcels/properties; i.e. if more than 1 business adjacent, then max.  $X .9 = \text{total for entire site}$ , 3 or more  $X .8$ , 5 or more  $X .7$ , etc.*
- Encourage parking behind buildings.*
- Bike racks.*

## **NEW BUSINESS:**

### **Downtown Alliance Report:**

At this point the DBA is in term discussions with the land owners involved with the possible new garage. Greg stated that the hotel group is not currently showing great interest in building the convention center. Greg has spoken with C.H. Johnson Consulting out of Chicago and asked that they look at a possibility of a convention center not only in downtown but possibilities on the west end and heights. Greg said that it is possible that they may look at lowering the amount of spaces to 500 with looking seriously at developing condos on the top.

New maps will be coming out soon. Included is 10-hour meter zones & garage locations. The new kiosks are up and they have all been updated with new maps and information.

Greg asked if Chris would look into the possibility of a multi pay station option for the loan a bike program if he decides to go with a multi pay station for meters. Chris stated that he would definitely look into it.

### **Informational Items:**

The residents in the area of Lordwith have started to get signatures to start a neighborhood permit parking program. Until all signs are changed or removed, the volunteers will continue to ticket in this area to all vehicles during school days/hours. The residents have been directed to Engineering to complete this process. Randy stated that if they contact the Parking Division that they be told to come in to the next Parking Division meeting to discuss their requests so that the Board can figure out how exactly the permit process will be handled. Greg suggested that Chris contact Chris Nauman in Bozeman as he is in charge of the resident program there.

The technology report is still in the process of information gathering. Chris is expecting an existing conditions report soon.

The City is still working with the potential buyer for the Park 4 garage however; there is no new information to report. Greg stated that the sale of Park 4 is quite important to the building of the "Park 5" garage. Chris needs to speak with Bruce McCandless in regards to a possible small committee to be involved during the negotiations with members being someone from the P.A.B., the real estate community, ect.

The new sweeper for the parking garages is now in our possession. Sweeping will be done by the Parking Division Staff 2-3 times a year or as needed basis.

The new pick-up that has been allotted in the replacement plan has been ordered and should arrive sometime in the spring. Chris has ordered a metallic blue Ford F150.

Adjourn:

The meeting was adjourned at: 5:46 p.m.